

SOUTH AFRICA: EXPLORING THE TRAJECTORY TOWARDS A BETTER POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC FUTURE

problem. We gotta figure this out. Yeah, it's going to be a big class factor right Through the education system as well of people who get to gain access to decent online stuff and kids are not. It's going to be a massive separation Yeah.

Because of the music.

I don't know who was that.

Adam. I enjoyed your book on the Suspended revolution.

immensely. It was very attractive to thinking about Zimbabwe

as unusual as it is because we are responding to a recent crisis in South Africa which offers us the opportunity to bring together among the best minds that we have in South Africa. even if they're dispersed as they are. some out there in Europe. People like Adam and Toby but nevertheless, engaged at home. Thanks to social media. Thanks to this technology.

Today Exploring

Politiker

and so what I'm going to do now is introduce a panel and discusses uh and start straight away At first is Adam, a professor, Adam Habib. South African, an academic activist, a public intellectual director of psoas, West of London, but previously, a VC and principle of University of the in South Africa. Prominent political

scientists about whom we are very proud. cofounder of the Research Universities alliances. It's published in numerous books and among the most prominent which obviously has qualified in among other things for this task this evening. is his book, South Africa's Suspended Revolution 2013 hopes and prospects and another one. 2019. Rebels and Rage reflecting on fees must fall

I do. out there in London.

Thank you. Our next after after Adam will come Young lady. and an economist who runs her own economic consulting company, New investments significantly Tabby was appointed to the Presidential Economic Advisory Council in 2019. She sits on this statistics, South Africa Council. where she shares the economic committee She was appointed by the minister of finance in 2018 to review the zero rated products in order to support the poor and vulnerable in the country.

that. some years ago already.

Uh she's somewhere in Europe at the moment. but safe identity and electoral politics. rights regularly for newspapers and provides nurses on electoral electronic media.

It's an accomplished public intellectual Oh, it's uh disgust as discussed with Doctor Paola. He's joining us today at another assignment. He's a former assistant general

of South Africa. A position he held for almost 20 years. He was a founding chair of the Statistics Commission of Africa and the African Symposium on statistical development

Yeah. Oh it has so many honors too many to mention. and several honorary doctorates from Bosch from was

The University of here with professor of practice and so on and so forth. And then we have no Casa a professor at School of Public Law at University of Cape. She's a senior research associate at UC work focused on land or gender and cultural issues Professor Garza had a long history of political and women's rights activism extending before the dawn of democracy in South Africa. I been, I've been detained to the at the tender age of fourteen in the former trans long time in the the changes of Belize.

Welcome to do. I don't see you there that I saw on the on the Then my brother Russell him. We'll be joining us later founder and we're going executive director of the Center for the Constructive of Disputes Accord which he founded in 1992 Vas is currently involved in the Sudan Peace process. has served on several commissions in South Africa and he serves on the boards of several institutions across the world including the steering committee of the Paris Peace right now, he's involved

in Durban dealing with the recent crisis. So, if it's late, please forgive him. He's busy. There's another brother of mine. Professor Seth Cooper. I'm from the days of the early 70s. When we are colleagues and comrades in the black conscious movement. with me on this side of the border and he and Steve and others like bunny Pichu down there and Seth has been a long time in the trash. Robin Island. Detention here and there but here it looks too strong. Growing up in the struggle. Well, welcome Seth. Welcome. Glad to have you. Last but not the least, my brother Eddie Malo, professor Eddie Malo, he's the chief executive officer of African, The peer review mechanism. and a professor at the University of this School of Governors. previously special adviser to the minister of International Relations and published in South Africa. and South Africa. special representative to the Great Lakes region and special adviser to the deputy president of the Pussy He's been an adviser on governance issues He's a true, truly African and diplomat Welcome to you all. So, we got much to do. Ask Adam. to get us going. Thanks. Uh colleagues. It's lovely meeting you. I'm glad that I'm doing it from afar but it's really a wonderful opportunity to deflect in this Um I am mindful that I'm speaking from

afar and I'm mindful that I'm not on the ground uh and so in the initial days of uh the protests and uh if you like the food uh revolves what uh I was II from making any comments. I tried to do a lot of reading. I spoke to lots of colleagues on the ground uh and I basically let those in South Africa make the cities of of of of reflections that needed to be done and then if you like I did a intervention in the Daily Maverick that reflected back on what colleagues were thinking about what they were saying and try think through what this means for the developmental issues and the challenges that face South Africa. and that's what I'm going to speak of. It seems to me II want to kick off by saying that this represents the the the most significant challenge to the poster state since 1994 uh and um it does depend on how we see this uh these protests and what form they take It's simply a food revolt by the people who many of whom are really struggling to live under the challenging conditions we find ourselves or was it an attempt by some factions within the ANC and outside of it to ferment? uh a rebellion and in the process that rebellion went viral Those are two very distinct analysis. Now, of course, there's an overlap between the two if we see it simply as a revolt, then our course of action has to be

a slightly different one. If we see it as an attempted rebellion by some actors within the ANC and outside and that when subsequently vital and culminated in the food vault uh then our action has to be slightly different and I want to put that uh squarely the agenda I think as part of my introductory remarks, I think it's important to think through this and then reflect our potential solutions on the basis of that. So, that's the first substantive remark that I was quite keen on on highlighting in this context If we are going to dissolve and address this challenge, it seems to me that we have to address it levels. One of which we speak about a lot of uh inequality, mainly progressive have to raise the issue of inequality and the fact that we need to address inequality. I think this is broadly correct. Second, more conservative elements in those who are in the security operators sometimes speak of security independently of inequality. They see this is a security problem Uh and that's the kind of lens that one begins to understand it. My argument is in this piece has been that we actually got to see it at three levels. Yeah. Any developmental enterprise, any attempt to address the challenge where we has to be constructed on a trip apartheid on a trip apartheid

agenda. The first is addressing inequality. The second is addressing security and what I call political stability and the third addressed in state capacity. If you are looking on addressing inequality and I'm sure uh that other colleagues are more trained uh to speak about this study will probably speak about this in much greater detail. We have to do it at two levels. One at the level of policy and the second at the level of behavior at the level of policy. we have to be comfortable and politically committed to addressing the increasing inequality in the and the expanding the increase in the geologic that needs to be our focus as opposed to other priorities which is simply creating a new generation of entrepreneurs, etcetera. As much as that is important and I'm not arguing against it. It seems to me that the singular focus of our policy should be to drive down the journey uh and Frank We've tried to do other things that driven has driven the coefficient up in quite a bit and so we need to resolve that policy challenge. The second policy challenge that we need to deal with is you can't bring down the genie coefficient, insufficient scale unless you drive employment and if you're going to drive your employment, you're going to have to grapple with the tension between

employment and driving employment up and some of the and tensions with the unions who are intent on keeping uh salaries and other things structured in a particular format and so you need to resolve the policy tensions that exist uh in the ruling party and in in in government itself The second uh way to deal with inequality seems to be behavior and in that, you may not have to marshal the private sector but I would argue that the private sector but also civil society in the unions to start singing from the same hymn you need them to. You need to drive the private sector in a way that allows you to make profit but all allows it to also become responsive to national development and to the agendas. uh and to start being responsive to what we need to do. So, you need to steward that and in a sense, vote resolving the economic detentions and marshal behavior. Whether it's the private sector, whether it's civil society was fundamental to understanding the developmental experiences of Southeast Asia and often we don't uh we don't sufficiently talk about that but what also the Southeast Asian developmental experience brings to the poor is if you want to do have an economic agenda that addresses inequality, you've gotta have two other things.

One is the and stability. If you don't have security and stability, you can't increase investment in productive enterprises and you can't bring that. Uh you can't then drive the kind of economic growths and the employments that you are meant to achieve. Now, if you're going to do that in Southeast Asia, they did it under authoritarian systems but there are experiences in other parts of the world. We're security established and the democratic systems but it seems to me that you have to take security seriously and the problem with South African progressives too often is we don't want to be insecurity and we are complacent about the violence that is in protest. We all, almost all of our strips are violent. almost all of our civil society protests are violent and some of it has to do with the nature of our policing and we need to address that but there is tendency that we've become complacent about violence and so long as we are complacent about violence, we don't take security seriously and you don't create the second dynamic that is important for addressing inequality and then the third element is what I call state state capabilities and again, the development experience is quite clear. You can't imagine a development experience that marshals the private sector to behave in

particular ways or civil society to behave in particular ways without having a state that is capable of doing that and when you need a state that is capable of doing that, need people who are sufficiently and appropriately qualified and frankly we're lying to ourselves. If we say that we don't, we take uh qualifications seriously in appointments to the state. I can tell you this from personal experience, how often I've had to debate colleagues about qualifications. Now, it's true that meritocracy is racially encoded in South Africa but the to a racially encoded meritocracy is not to say we don't need me at all. It's to deal with its it's to establish indicators that are not racialized indicators. It's not to deny the importance of qualifications as has happened in many many uh institutions in the state. I mean half off there was an analysis done a couple of years ago that most CFOs and local government level can't read That's a to be. How do you expect them to manage at the developmental state at the local level? So, stability and state capacity. I mean, state capacity needs to be taken seriously. What does this all mean? Well, one of the things in the development enterprise that we need to think through is how you sequence these three uh trip elements. You can't get

the the inequality uh issues addressed in the investment that is required without addressing security issues and you can't get the inequality and marshal of the uh of the private sector and the unions and civil society without some level of state capacity. So, you have to take these all of these elements quite seriously and frankly, there are enough evidence. empirical evidence in the South African context for the last 5 years 10 years, it's become worse but prior to that, where we didn't take security uh state capacity uh and economic resolving the economic conundrums seriously and so that's what uh my piece in the Daily Maverick set. Let me give you two pragmatic reasons why I think we need to start taking Sec seriously and I provocative put in the Daily Maverick article that I believe that at least we're required in the early days a state of emergency, a partial state of emergency in was natal and and uh uh and um and that flowed out of my understanding of what actually happened. Uh if we see uh these revolves as having been impart fermented, a fermented rebellion by elements within the ANC and outside that went viral, then you can almost be committed. You can always be guaranteed that those actors are going to act would do it again and if there isn't, if you like the attempt, to

contain them to hold them accountable. then, this is we will be back here Just bear in mind that actually more for the last three or 4 years, 5 years, we've had people burning down trucks in in the void of the plaza, a kind of low intensity sabotage apologists framework and we haven't acted seriously about this as a state repeatedly and it's to me that we need to take this seriously and if you're going to do that, we're going to have to act there. One of the things that is quite striking is many of those who fermented the rebellion, not only do so, they did it through parallel structures, new business organizations, new civic entities, and they use those entities to start fermenting the politics that played out that ultimately played out in the world that plays so you can't not actually act and It seems to me that security a much more uh substantial security agenda has to be taken seriously. The only then can you stabilize the situation to follow through on the issues that are addressing and muscling the private sector, the unions, the policy agendas, and the state capacity issues that you need. The second reason why you need this done is at this moment, large parts of civil society have lost faith in the state in is the foundational part of the state.

I give up my uh right to bear arms. uh in exchange for the state, giving me security and I obey the monopoly and violence that has been abandoned because effectively large parts of actors insult have taken the security into their own hands uh through neighborhood. I watched uh insecurity uh mechanisms and now, I'm particularly terrified of that because it seems to me that it's really dangerous to decentralize uh security to the neighborhood committees and to particularly centralize it to privatize neighborhood security. uh committees because in effect this takes a racial for me in many parts of our country and is a recipe for a racial configuration at some point. It's it's not acceptable under any conditions but it becomes more so in the racial us in society like ours and so I think it's a really dangerous thing to allow and therefore, the state needs to reassert insecurity. Of course, we need capacities. We need to develop the state's capacities to act in appropriate ways but we cannot have a situation where the state aggregates its responsibility to take seriously the security of its citizens. Otherwise, you're going to see more and more conflicts is appearing in Phoenix and in parts of Durban and I think that's dangerous thing to allow and so, my

argument is effectively if we're serious about a sustainable solution, we gotta recognize it's going to be addressing inequality. It's addressing state capacity and it's addressing security and frankly, in the short term, we have to start taking it seriously. Securing uh citizens safety taking seriously. the security dimension both to contain the actors who fermented the in the first place but also to make sure that we don't allow privatized security arrangements to emerge in neighborhoods because that runs the risk of even further racial configurations and so that's where I would stop you uh as my first set of ideas on how I think we need to think this through. Thank you very very much. Thanks, Adam. Thanks very much for outlining the tripod as you call it. just now two questions I have. Um is this issue of uh I think the three inequality addressing inequality, addressing security, addressing state capacity, in really describes the requirements for developmental state. No doubt about that and my question first question is whether you think security, the security issue is a serious as painted today in Daily Maverick by one Oscar Vidal. I don't know if you say to that article is uh things like that is that where he's arguing? state security or

the the the National Security Agency is basically collapsed. That's his argument. Is it as bad as that any of you So, my view and I'm looking between me, you and me, There's three fundamental challenges in the security dimension. I think it's very very serious and I think we are being complacent if we if we don't take it seriously enough, I think partly the security agencies have divided they're divided because the party is factual and the fact of the party has intended has manifested in the security apparatus itself. So, that's the first, the second is It doesn't matter whether I suspect that they didn't know but even if they didn't this either incompetence or complicity and both of those are fundamentally dangerous to the democratic state uh because this should have been they should have known and if they didn't know, they should have the capacity to act very quickly to stop the the spread of the violence that and either way that wasn't there and then the third is actually, this isn't new. Every single protest has been that has over the last five 7 years has been violent. It hasn't reached the scale of this violence but it's been violent. You know, it's not the first time that we've had trucks burned in the void of a complex. This is the fifth or sixth time in as many years

with this has happened So clearly in there are all kinds of reports about I'm going to another elements being involved in this part is associated with the ruling party. I love. I think we're going to take this more seriously than it is. So, that's why people do raise the history of the bill of Rights and I think that that's something we should be worried about but that's why I think it's not a permanent state of emergency and second, it's a puzzle but I do think we gotta take security seriously and I think one of the things that a state of emergency does that we're it really cuts through the party and actually very clear that the line authorities to the commander in chief and that I think is important when you got a divided security at the records and more importantly, you got a divided party We'll come back to this. especially the the issue of the state capacity that before I turn to uh to to look at the problem of inequality poverty, unemployment specifically just one word How do we address the problem of state capacity which uh from all accounts uh people reflecting on the events of earlier this month in the newspapers, the people like Bunny Tom people like William and I'm no no doubt will be touching on it. There's evident evidence of a state capacity problem. How do we begin

addressing that? What would recommendations briefly. So, I think that by the way, the state capacity problem, I think you're right. What this uh these protests brought to the floor is the state, the state incapacity in the security services intelligence has collapsed. uh ability to act as collapsed, etcetera and by the way, we've seen this multiple times over the years. My own view is we're going to have to have appropriately qualified people to to to be able to play the role We have to start appointing more appropriately of people with skill sets, appropriate skill sets with appropriate training with appropriate development. and frankly in the police service and actually the defense force. You need people that meet certain fitness levels to achieve the purposes that they need and frankly, in all of these things, we aggregate these rules. uh which would never, I mean, just look at the age categories of the South African defense course and then appropriate defense forces in other parts of the world that are highly competent and you'll see just age categories and all of that. They are quite striking striking pictures The second is is that I do think that there are capacities um and and this is what's the interesting thing about the South Africa, South Africa has

certain capacities within its institutions but they don't enable them. Uh there are certain capacities within the private sector that we need to look at. So, I would think in the short term, you need new appointments uh particularly at the levels of leadership you need to shift some people's out. You need to bring other people in. You need to borrow some capacity from the private sector and in the medium term need to start getting new types of people appointed with new skill sets, new training, um but in the short term, this is the great thing about South Africa. We do. You have capacities. The problem is they become privatized. They're sitting in the private sector. you need to master them, put them on the state state management processes and you need leadership for that. People who are committed to that agenda in the short term and then we're looking at the training arm in the medium term
Thanks, Adam.

to please

Uh thanks Igbo and thanks for that. I'm very very interesting and and um I think you captured our problems very well. I'm just going to now talk about the economic um problems that we find ourselves in and and I'm going to try to answer some of the reasons why we are in this predicament. Um I'm going to start with uh you know our

GDP the structure of the economy and then I'm going to look at um employment and the fiscus and then hopefully, leave the rest to the Q and A session. So, if you look at, you know, the South Africa's economy has not been growing um very well especially if you look at the past 10 years, we're really barely, you know, have grown uh uh by 2% and and this talks to employment as well which I'll which I'll speak to you later and hopefully I see that um that has also joined in and and he will also give us a picture of the South African economy and and also throw in a few statistics as the former general and so if you look at as I was saying, if you look at the South African economy, it hasn't been growing especially in the past 10 years I actually blame. I blame the structure of the South African economy for that. If you look at the composition of the South African economy, it's actually very well balanced. It's not, we're not heavily weighted on mining or retail or whatever sector manufacturing but what has been worrying is a development that has happened in the, you know, recent three 4 years and that is that the sector that has been growing the most has been the finance sector. Now, the finance sector is sector that doesn't employ a lot of people. It's very low

labor intensive and it's not treatable and the sector that actually should be, you know, growing fast sectors that should be growing fast. Uh the manufacturing sector, agriculture, and mining and um I'll add tourism there and these are because these are tradable sectors. We get a lot of tech. We should, you know, get a lot of receive a lot of trade revenues from them. Um they're high labor intensive so they absorb a lot of um workers employment and they don't require high skills and high skilled labor just like um with finance and unfortunately these sectors, especially the manufacturing sector over the years has been shrinking rather than expanding. So, fewer and fewer people are working in the Or part of the manufacturing sector. So, again, so, so this is part of the, you know, structural rigidity that we're seeing in the South African economy when we now look at employment, I always ask people, it's unfortunate that we are you doing this virtually but it was very interesting to see what caused people in this um participants like but let's just choose a Ferrari. The South African economy is like a Ferrari with an engine of an Uno. Um I don't know if you um if many of you remember that Uno, the small car and and you can't then accelerate, you can't grow fast if you're

unemployment. Um if you if you've got such high unemployment rate uh and and that's how I'd characterize the South African economy. Very beautiful aesthetically but at the same time cannot if you don't that take off. um growth that we want to see uh because of you know, very high unemployment Now, if look at the unemployment figures, you know, the South African economy, if you look at um the if you consider the the the discouraged workers, the unemployment rate, it's it's closer to about 40% and if you look at what is worrying is the youth unemployment rate which is about 70%. If you look at um the broader definition of and and this is also, you know, a huge burden on the South African growth path and growth. TRAJECTORY, why we're not growing. graduate unemployment rate um is also very high at around and these are ages between fifteen and 24. and these are averaging around you know, 40% these are very high numbers and and what is very start with the recent numbers from stats that says that graduate uh unemployment so those with university degrees um that That figure is 9.3% and a few years ago, that figure was 2.3%. When we're worried that you know, the uh graduates aren't um getting employed Uh again, you see, if you look at the not in employment education

and training what we call the needs. um between the ages of fifteen and 24 about 1010 1000010 1000010.2000000. um uh people putting those age groups are not an appointment education and training. So, again, when we go back to our sectors, the sectors are not employed, they're not absorbing labor but then, let's also look at the education system. Uh I know that um professor Habib mentioned um education slightly and as someone who actually has 5° three from university I you know II have a different view about education in South Africa. If I look at other countries such as, you know, the Scandinavian countries and also um Uh Sutherland which I think gives us a great barometer. in Switzerland. 30% of the Swiss have university degrees. 70%, um apprenticeship go through apprenticeship. They get uh employed in in, you know, blue chip companies, those who've been through apprenticeship and I think the difference here is that in a country like Switzerland, the university degree, I mean, the high school, you know, the the metric and the the matrix certificate is is a metric is well-trained first Ameri which which I think that um do not have the equivalent training. So, from metric from that metric certificate, it's easy for someone to then be absorbed into labor through

apprenticeship or uh they can start their own business and become entrepreneurs and that's because the education that they received at you know, um at high school level equips them to understand the balance sheet to understand basic accounting to conduct business. Um which our metric and our metric degree or or or or or the education that we receive, it does not equip any metric with those. Um very key um uh essentials for running a business for either being an entrepreneur or also uh going through an apprenticeship system and so I think that is also a really big problem when you look at why are we not why are South Africans so highly, You know, the unemployment rate is high and the structure of the economy is is you know, balanced at the same time. It's not absorbing labor but also what is going on within our education system and partly, you know, we we we II want to emphasize that the fact that all the reason why we have this poor education outcomes as historical but we don't seem to overcome the historical burden and I think that if we also look at ways in which we can um find way uh you know, overcome these historical burdens. It will go go a long way into shrinking this unemployment rate. The other problem which I'm seeing in South Africa currently is that there's

actually really only one pipeline between um high school and um and employment and that is university getting that territory education and if you you look at other systems elsewhere, we did a way with the technics but they should be multiple layers and various pipelines of getting employment besides their university degree. Uh the tits, um college, uh are not um very successful currently and many of those who went through the TV uh system do not uh are not employed which is also worrying and we need to we tend to even when the system doesn't work, we we still continue with it until um you know, 10 years or 20 years of complete failure uh uh and so I think We need to review the TV system. I would, you know, strongly recommend that we introduce the technical system and various other systems that bridge between employment and and um that metric certificate high school level education. So, that is is is the problem with the the and labor absorption and and the youth employment that we're seeing. We've had tried various ways. I think there's the you know the the uh yes program and I don't that these programs are working efficiently. I think that we're not talking enough about education and education reform and we're not talking enough about and and not doing enough in terms of getting

corporate South Africa to absorb a lot of these um uh of other metrics and train them and also absorb um uh graduates. The other problem that we have in South Africa. So, I was part of the um I contributed towards the free education. um report the uh I think it was called that he had commission and I was part of that commission where I investigated ways in which to fund free education and in that report, it was very clear that we, you know, as a country, we cannot afford to be education and this moves me to the fiscal. Um we are fiscally constrained as much as yes. we we tend to talk about South Africa as a wealthy country. the way we Our resources is um is insufficient. It makes it very inefficient because it we allocating our resources. towards uh consumption uh based um um areas of the fiscal rather than an investment based. So, um even as we are speaking today, the the burden of the of free education um is heavy on the fiscal and I think that we, you know, various ways of overcoming and overcoming this and it still hasn't um and obviously the the previous the former president announced recklessly, I must say without reading the full report announced that we should have free free education and um even though we we recommended various ways to overcome that.

So, in a fiscally constrained country, the other burden on the fiscal and social grants and you know, we always say a measure of a successful um social ground system is the way in which the the recipients are um they're less and less people who are reliant on the social grants and I think politically what we've seen The more people who are reliant on the social ground system isn't has become a measure of the success of the social system. Um currently, was natal and this also relates to what happened recently was natural has about 4 million people. It has the highest number of social grant recipients standing at 4 million. The second highest is halting at two point. 2.2 .9000000. Then the third is Eastern Cape at 2.8000000 If you look at, you know, where we were in 2016. So, it's 2000 2006. There were only 3 million recipients of social grants in 2019. So, in 1990, 623 million recipients of social grants in 2000, there were 9 million in 2003. Um there were 14 million where we see a big jump is between 2004 and two with 2004. We had about um 20 million 20000020. percent of recipients. And then at 2000. 2010, we had 14 million. So, 30% of our population reliant on on social grants which was 14, million people in 2010. That's the big leap between 3 million in 1996 and 14 million

in 2010. and so, this also speaks to policy failure that in all this time, we were unable to solve the, you know, triple challenge of unemployment and poverty and and inequality and what we saw is the opposite happening that more and more people fell within this, you know, dependency on the social grants as we speak. Now, there are about 818 million South Africans that are reliant on social grants compared to 3 million in 1996 and that is about 31% of the population and then last year, which was um you know, as a very you for the economy We were in a recession before the pandemic and um we went into a very deep and very strict lockdown which resulted in many people losing their jobs and being reliant on the social increasingly. So, on the social Grant program and last year, we had sixty-one 61% of South Africans relying on some form of social assistance and that is again, a significant number of people um are relying on the social grants. So, again, when you go back to growing the economy and going to my example of choosing a Ferrari with an engine of an Uno, it is very difficult for South Africa to reach this, you know, to see accelerated uh growth when a huge proportion of the population is unemployed and increasing reliant or relying on the social grant

program. It is also very difficult for us to get out of this economic rat with our policies that are very targeted at the bottom. So, we need to see bottom up uh policies that are targeted at a very poor at the vulnerable at the marginalized in order for us to start growing the economy and I think that the previous policies were very top down and didn't quite reach the the poorest of the poor who are now actually in the majority if we're if um we consider over 50% of South Africans living in poverty. Um so, there is a policy failure. There is a lack of um I think uh an understanding of what the urgency of uh of of this problem and when we saw the alcoholic uh uh know an insurrection because that's what I believe it is. I do not believe that the poor uh would intentionally be that disruptive. They have been every year in South Africa. we have social service delivery protests and that's because especially in the peripheral outside of the urban areas in some years, we've had, you know, over a thousand um service delivery protests where poor people have been protesting on the lack of of of uh um electricity, lack of water, road infrastructure, etcetera and never have they been as disruptive as we saw in the, you know, 2 weeks ago. So,

I think that it is unfair to then blame it What happened on the poor? And we have had an increasing number of poor people and we haven't seen that kind of disruption Secondly, we've seen infrastructure such as, you know, the ports and um water purification centers and um you you know, the telecommunication uh lines etcetera being demolished, burned, etcetera and that is not interest of the poor people to do so. Um I, you know, poor people, opportunistic, uh looted um but but it is the you know, the insurrection was not um started by by poor people but there is a danger having huge unemployment, huge social unrest, neglecting people who are poor, who are vulnerable, not having policies that are targeted at uplifting their their livelihood and South Africa has always been at this, you know, at at at a at this fault lines where and it'll be easy and it's still easy to trigger um anything and insurrection like what we saw recently because of the social dynamics and the socioeconomic dynamics that we find ourselves in. 10.2000000 people not in the educational training policy failure. They call it 50% in poverty. the need for Baltimore policies to grow the economy. Before I ask uh uh come in soon after you What's what do you mean by bottom up policies to grow the economy Derby? What

this will look like in your view? What would you do? What would you recommend? So, what we've done in the past uh is that we've we've taken resources out of um rural and queer areas and allocated them to areas where which are you know typically urban areas even in in the way we've allocated resources So they There's every time when there's an issue with with an S conferences and there's re appropriation or appropriation of funding, what is typically happened over the years is that we've money has been taken out of municipalities and not just municipalities but programs such as housing programs such as, you know, schooling, infrastructure, uh where there's currently a deficit. A lot of our schools need to be funded. uh needs to be reconstructed because some of them are not very for Education road infrastructure needs to be um needs to be to to to to be rolled out. Uh the the other thing is that we need to capacity and put in place um people who understand how to manage municipalities and local governments especially in the, you know, in the rural areas to help with with um rolling out of these programs because these programs are essentially uh the in in in the ambit of uh municipalities are not um national government. So, if municipalities do not provide

these services, um then then the rural people and poor people do not have access to these to these um to these resources. Um so, it is we've seen a lot of taking away our funding these areas and allocating them differently to AA which is really not you know, for people don't utilize it to also Ecomm to dial to a lot of these uh struggling state entities in the past at the detriment of the poor um and and if you look at what stats say has been producing in terms of municipality funding and infrastructure deficit. Um we see that there's a lot um of there's a lot of development and funding that needs to be allocated towards certain regions and often regions people reside You're on the presidential advisory. Uh Council. What did you say are the most urgent issues before you in the next few weeks? So, something that's Okay. Something that we've done successfully. Um it is that we have we've seen the issue of Ecom Ecomm. We've prioritized Ecomm uh because businesses were struggling to operate and um and it it and over the past I think 10 years, 160 Billion has been allocated to um TOWARDS Es com and so what we've done is that we've pushed government. we pushed the president to announce finally that um can now generate their own electricity capacity up to

100 megawatts which was a big thing. So, we're just waiting now on the uh the government department of uh Minerals and Energy to then put together the groundwork for that to happen. One thing I'm personally working on right now is the release of Spectrum. Um you know, we cannot and which is also a very one of those that is bottom up because right now it's a very Spencer for the poor people. people in rural areas to afford data Um we are, you know, one thing that the pandemic has done is really pushed us into a digital world where we are now selling products online meetings online, etcetera and again, what the pandemic has done is highlight and exacerbated the inequalities between people, those who have data, those who can afford it. Uh those who have to internet. are faring much better than than those who don't and in our case, it is not even about just only restricted to financing and there are areas in the country where uh people do not have um a broadband coverage and so what is needed and this is again a policy that was actually South Africa committed to in 2005 uh to the International Telecommunications Union that we will be moving out of analog to digital and therefore, more space for um spectrum so that we can have more spectrum We

are, I don't know. Um we are now 2000. Um 2002000 2002021 without any um digital migration. We have had eleven ministers in the telecommunication space who have not implemented you know, uh uh this migration and again, the people who are suffering the most are those who are um who don't have band. who are poor and who who are in in very remote areas of the the the country. So, we are pushing for Spectrum. the release of Spectrum and also the the the move um from analog to digital Thanks and we'll come back to you. Thanks. Uh it's a pleasure. Um you stayed at last night to come in straight away. to keep us on the economic track.

Okay, come in. I realized that uh I don't know what happened but uh I we lost connection. So, they go ahead. We can hear you. but thank you very much. Uh I'm sorry. a lot of ground on these matters and that uh aging us as South Africa I usually talk uh through illustrations and uh uh probably I talk a lot but uh as well as uh and thank you very much for inviting me and the demands on this occasion and uh uh uh I thought that perhaps one of the things that we don't have in the country are foresight tools Uh we share the apartheid regime had Um our plans are not against and they like the seriousness and robust

that a actually has. I mean, if you think about the NDP, it was fantastic. Agreed upon by many uh but uh absolutely never left the shelf to be implemented. So, uh the plans that we have talked about from the Rd uh and so on and so on. Um in the last uh 27 years, we have heard about uh certain things that are called plants up to the nine point plan and then the fourteen point plan and then of course the new dawn and everything and you you no longer know whether this thing is a slogan or a player and that uh idle mindedness around serious matters of the state create a serious problem for us now, I think uh we in the Rd we define a socially desirable act that the Apartheid regime has imposed on us that that is social desirable and is the dismantling of Apartheid and it had uh this five it is. making South Africa work and then implementing Rd Of course, it led an economically feasible plan. but nonetheless, it and agreed upon social desirable and with the political and mobilizing also and therefore, we need to work out how do we make it work, Economical. Now, it's been 7 years later, this is where we are. We're looting and everything that has happened Of course, uh Devon and all the ports and everything has come to a almost a standstill. These are the

numbers that we are told. Uh 50 billion uh that uh impact on National GDP and of course 277 people 300 people dead almost four times the number of people that died at this one's died and democracy. It's it's it's it's it's and they die in the month of Mandela Now, when we think about the priorities and the statistics for 17 years and some of the things he had to be interested in is what are the priorities of this country Of course, ranked. number one was access to reliable safe and water level of employment and cost of electricity. and then, well, I was amazed by the priorities she had but uh these are the priorities that people have talked about and at number was education. Now, if you have a society whose priorities are, you can't expect a lot because if education is not a priority, then it's not something you can action upon or mobilize society around. and it's not something that the politician will stand up there and say, we'll give give you education. No, because it's not that kind of a priority. So, this is the dilemma we have and in fact, this is where we started in 1953 in September when the said, what is the use of a child mathematics when it cannot use it in practice? and instead of actually addressing this mathematics issue and the stem We don't need to introduce something called

mathematics.

The must be
smiling all the way to heaven.
seeing that his problem is
actually working even today.
Now, there's a way to arising.
We're actually a reaction to an
apartheid system and education
system. 40, years later, fees
must fall I take a different
view uh from around the world I
made a submission to care
commission and I think uh Zuma
was correct to say it must be
free. I think we are refusing
to see the national priority.
that uh only at university. We
have the stadium in numbers
that are adequate by raise
group which is what we are
trying to resolve The students
there are in numbers that are
adequate proportionately or
rather it's disproportionate
but we have a good number of
whites, a good number of
blacks, a good number of
Indians, and a good number of
color who in that space. And
they are the elites that musty
and then I don't want to say
the elitist. They are the
leaders of the future. and they
must define what this country
should be. It is not a big
price to pay 100 billion for
them to be in and pay for
everyone. and give them the
assignment defined for us what
this country should be like
this nitpicking of saying pay
for the rich pay for the poor.
It's it's a situation of time
and it's a waste of time and II

didn't want to go into this other issues uh which are policies are actually dysfunctional the family fabric in South Africa. that's in the land itself to these things of a household that has this kind of income where you think that there's a family there. The families are dysfunctional. In fact, they are abusive of women and children on trying to make that family pay for itself. Also, the policy was not saying how many children should be paid for. Is it assuming that there's only one child? the household now, the policyakers were actually devoid of the social fabric of what South Africa is particularly in the black family.

I believe that it is not a big price to pay for everyone at the university with the assignment to ensure that they define the future. The whole thing was pushing the ball into the the universities as though the universities have a lot of money and vice chancellor deal with something that government must be leading. That's what Africans did. They said you prepare for it Now, if you look at this, these are the number of children that are born every year. See the the bedroom the beat. 1.2000000 was 980. 984 thousand here. Now, it's 1.2000000 of all these children by 2016. They start somewhere in school or whatever. 610 of them, thousand of them managed

to write me. We have lost 600 thousand even before they ride metric 442 thousand are said to have passed. Of course there's a 30% pass rate and only 150 thousand of them actually qualified go to a university or to a decent institution of higher learning. We have produced and reproduced this all the time and nothing is changing and our policies are stuck on this thing. I don't know what our thoughts thinking is uh and then of course, we say 72% pass rate uh 67% pass rate we must face our password on the base of 1.2000000 1.2000000 say, what is 150 Thousand of 101.3 is 10% that pass rate Who's successful? managed to go through a constitutionally mandated basic education. We only achieve 10% and of course, I agree with that. Uh surely this thing will fail Grade one to me doesn't work. You need to actually intrude other forms of training which unfortunately, we destroy and here we are not showing by raise how different race groups have performed uh from grade one to passing grade seven uh grade nine and grade twelve and you can see that of these things across time. Only at grade one that we have, we are now having grade seven. We almost got close but beyond that point, it has been worse. In fact, it's getting worse. Here we are looking at those who actually compete in a trick

and it's white Indian colored,
and black and here's the
percentage and here's a cross
tie. the graph that goes that
way tells us that we are doing
something better. A graph that
goes that way. It means the
country's sailing and let's see
how it it. This is now 90% of
the population.

modifications. It's massive. Am
I against blacks about 2%? And
here's Abbott and all those and
this is the biggest challenge
that we have around. How do we
scale this population and in
absolute numbers, South Africa,
we see 60 million people It has
only 2 million or so uh people
who have uh a high level or
something degrees uh with
blacks at least they're
somewhat bigger but uh
proportionate. you can see
amongst whites they are a 45%
of them have this and they live
a life of the Koreans. whereas
this one's this side. The
blacks is a different life.
now. coming to understand what
it means in terms of skilled
employment. This is the
proportion by race and by age
from fifteen to Twenty-four and
here at the Black, I mean
there's more proportion of them
amongst whites. I mean they're
way about 50% of skill by age
and the Indians who are there
that was 1994 fast forward at
2016 and you can see what has
happened amongst white and
amongst Indians and of course,
this reinforces the race. The

problem in South Africa and what happens here is Black Africans. Well, at Fifty-five to 64, there are 20% but amongst Twenty-five to Thirty-four instead of they've lost their share proportionate. they've reduced that level of competence and in fact, this is uh I'm not sure yet but if you look at people who did uh the the trades at the high school and the university or high school and so on before we change the the the techniques into universities and now we end up with us uh speaking English to a wound and uh a person who has to go and dig a try to fix your electricity speaks English to to the instead of fixing it, you find that those Thirty-five in the box. Enjoy a higher level of employment with the same qualifications or similar qualifications compared to those who are uh Twenty-five to 34 and yet, those with the level of education in AA degree kind of the same proportion more or less find employment compared to those who do the trade suggesting that the amalgamation of the trades of the universities degenerated and degraded the technical quality of education and employers are not taking that now. the worst thing that is happening and of course, we have this uh that I say that really gives the numbers. We cannot say the evidence is not

there. The evidence is there. Now, this side, we are looking at people who are employed and this side, we are looking at those who are unemployed. We are comparing 2008 in this inner color and the 2021 first quarter. So, this a very very current data set. in 2008. These were the number of people that were employed or rather these were the people that were employed in 2008. uh at by age group and these were the people that were unemployed by his group and this is the number of people that are unemployed by age groups by 2021 for all age groups but look at what happened in fifteen to 24 and the 25 to Thirty-four. These people lost their at the absolute numbers. These were two and a half million people employed at fifteen to 24 years with a growing population by 2001, Only 1 million were employed. The one and a half million have actually lost their share. Here is 500 thousand. So the younger people 2 million of them have lost their share in this period. If they look at this democracy project, they must be asking very difficult questions that uh our cats eating its kittens. So now, we worked on scenarios as part of that team and in fact, in 2016 and looked at and scenarios a common thing in South Africa, we've been doing them but there's been a vacuum of trying to work on scenarios

since 2008 and therefore, we have been working as a country for that period of time and the scenarios that we came out with you are confirmed and agree with that with the events of last week and the events that preceded this, we were in this nation a restless a nation torn between immobility and restless energy demoralized land of disorder and this is where we are as a country. This was the scenario which is which is a trickle down and here is New which is South Africa moving towards a destination that they hoped for since 1994. If we look at uh the outcomes of the NDP, social indicators, inequality, poverty, educational performance, If If look at economic indicators, employment, I've already talked about that A capital state governance FAILURES and hoes and pushing money in the SOE that have been failed and I think it's a shame that this is happening. Not that there's so it's important but surely if they are run down like that is contemplate and then of course, if you look at the incidents, uh it's it's state capture and then of course uh what happened uh in terms of uh uh uh uh looting in poverty It's an anchor for all social ills. to a thought is one of them. Poverty of politics. Poverty is an anchor for those ills and we could see the poverty of politics and poverty of thought

and poverty of material well
being that enriched the poor We
looked at the scenarios and
said, What is the scenarios?
What are these scenarios and
how best can we get out of this
in South Africa And there's
that. we got those and then
now, before we did that, we
looked at uh different
prospects by different
groupings business for South
Africa for instance, said if we
did the the following things,
unemployment will come down to
15% by 2030, South Africa's
economy will be 5.5000000000
which is 8 Trillion clearly
d'être tous by confidence
est est pleine
of the pro des
millions AND SOUTH AFRICA
forty. 40% Jobs created eight
to 9 million. The question that
we have to ask is if government
comes with this proposal that
is to us, unemployment will be
at 30% which they didn't
actually express in the
modeling exercise. neither did
they express poverty and so on
and here we are looking at the
growth of 3% when we want all
these things, you realize that
we cannot actually get South
Africa blocks and this is at
the heart of policy Is this all
that Is that This is
underwhelming but it is at the
heart of policy making in the
modeling exercise. We think Uh
of course, what we do at South
Africa. If you look at the
portrait of Gross account in

Franklin, if we were to think about increasing income per capital, the pathways are labor productivity. We could be looking at absorption rate and we could be looking at terms of trade but where we are, we don't think that we can actually impact on young dependency ratio nor can we impact on elderly tendency ratio which means that the social grants are with us forever. and therefore, they will not be a demographic dividend because the pathways towards growth towards a better life are all mediocre and have been destroyed. Of course, we are saying perhaps we could look at this differently and we are proposing a six pillar policy framework for South Africa and that's six pillars policy framework looks at how can we reach and about 5% growth rate which we reached between 2003 and 2008 and as and saw unemployment growing unemployment dropping somewhat inequality remaining still a very serious problem Okay. So, this is par

So,

uh growth rate at the moment is 1% where we are and we are arguing that if we looked at uh business as usual, uh that uh 1% will go to a .7 5.7% points 1.7. If we look at the microphones which is uh the

reforms that are contained in the treasury document of 2019 and uh the core of the reconstruction and recovery plan those we have only two seven percentage points which means if the base is 2%, if you do a 2% then we'll be at two Uh and then I trade and industry all those reforms. We'll add another .38 which is free. We are moving towards uh a 3.1%. If we tempt at the macroeconomic frame, then we could get another 1.43% which is great credit extension and so on but this is a sealed program. It cannot be touched. and therefore, we are depriving ourselves.

Okay. Now I have. Come on par. Okay. and this can end up. Oh yes, I am. I'm going to wind up with that 1 minute. I'll be done. Yeah. And then of course, uh half a percent in terms of a social policy, the social policies including the extension of the 350. it's not going to increase uh the GDP but it has a social impact and of course, private sector support uh .79 and uh finally uh external support and uh we will come in and then of course you will get the provincial and therefore 5.7% will be possible This is what we are putting before government and before ourselves and society to say, what if and that's what if if we sat together to look at this, what if perhaps South Africa, we have a better future

and for that, what if everything must be up for discussion? They cannot be a sealed possibility. Thank you very much.

you. you economist have really frightened us today.

out

of 60 million population only 2 million can be said to be educated. The race question is big

Maybe now, I would tend to Mitsubishi, please, can you raise our hopes of it? Come back to number country. It's a well, I'm afraid I'm not going to raise yours. Um anyway, firstly, I have to apologize for not uh match. uh party's colorful. Uh I hope you don't mind. you know is mine.

There are there are several factors involved in this uh in this problem we're dealing with and the number of perspectives have been offered Uh I am zooming into the National Question my III. Hope I won't disappoint you people. I'm not a policy type. Uh I'm still bogged down in explaining the spectacle or the oddity of a former president and the leader of the oldest liberation movement. uh being supported by Kinsman on account of uh ethnicity or similar ethnicity against what they thought was an intruding authority to arrest him and they look at the civil authority There's a foreign entity uh persecuting uh the Kingsman. So, this

practical, how is it possible that you would have this happening in this country in 2021 and indeed the what subsequently happened. after he's arrested. obviously has its origins. and over that weekend uh of the 2020 eighth 29th of July

So,

Here's my thesis. What happened? What we're seeing actually uh unintended consequences of a strategy uh that was used by the ANC. A strategy aimed at a national integration Um these are unintended consequences of that and the strategy employed in the early 90s. what we saw in was actually a return by Jacob Zuma to ethnic entrepreneurship. A strategy he applied uh between 2005 and 2008

One

of the problems by the way, I'm going to tell myself, I prefer to for about 15 minutes or so but I will certainly not exceed 20 minutes one of the challenges that there is your first step upon returning in 1990 was obviously reestablish itself. uh throughout the country as a national movement um and one of the problems was lack of acceptance. among certain communities. primarily because of ethnic stereotypes and ethnic loyalties and of course, this was not an entirely unexpected in South Africa

because I'm in the entire part.
uh uh strategy or the strategy
of the union government
beginning in 1910 was to
establish its Germany to divide
and rule and that Of course,
entailed ethnic balkanization.
beginning with the formation of
the union in 1910. when
Africans were denied franchise
which meant that they would not
be citizens of the union. but
then was a territorial
segregation legislated through
1913 and Acts uh essentially
keeping blacks on the one hand
and and whites within the union
and the Blacks were segregated
into a multi of ethnic
oriented. stands. and after
that, you had the passing of
the law, native apps in 1937
that defined Africans, not as
citizens but as tribes, man,
right? That each African belong
to a village somewhere and they
achieve and this, you know, uh
unfolded throughout uh
throughout the twentieth
century Um so what the NC found
in 1990 was not until you
unexpected. Uh you This ethnic
stereotypes. You have these a
number of mono mono cultural
communities which serve as a
photograph, ethnic prejudice,
ethnic stereotypes, mainly um
and these are fine. I mean,
stereotypes are common, a
common place to humanity. They
are not anything new but the
problem is when those
stereotypes are harnessed for
political purposes,

politicizing ethnic identity,
That's the particular problem
that the ANC faced in 1990. Um
especially in the instance of
the politicization of ethnic
identity Um just before I come
to KZ and as I said earlier,
this was not peculiar to Kaiser
and uh you had a similar
problem elsewhere. Um for
instance, uh in in in in places
like in places like Northwest
where you have new provinces
being created, provinces that
were made up of pans of
different ethnic groups
together. There were ethnic
tensions there and these
tensions that came up uh uh
especially over the election of
leaders in For instance, the
person that led especially the
southern part of of of Natal at
the time which was there but uh
the natal uh so called was uh
is obviously a native speaker
born in uh but his political
identity was uh in natural.
right. So, he emerged naturally
as as AUTF leader um but what
had happened in natal with with
the ANC now recruiting itself,
uh it had to face the problem.
uh that was posed by in where
in uh throughout the 80s uh had
had uh distorted uh the image
of the NC passed it as a tus
dominated the party as a way of
galvanizing support amongst
amongst locals and so in fact,
uh was this? Zulu and Zulu
interest? Um and Zulu were
generally that was the rhetoric
as uh urged and at times quest

to get a job, you had to be a member of at some places um and the ANC was printed as the enemy. the enemy that indicated for speakers. So, the problem then that they encountered upon um and it was the stigma that they had and so they had to create a friendly face. for the party. A familiar face that locust could identify with especially those who believe that the ANC was indeed a dominated party and so to have that familiarity with the AC, they had to to show up the the the Zulu aspect of the representatives of the NC, especially amongst conservative Zulu speakers and most local leaders. Uh they're Uh uh uh. Uh, uh, and a whole lot of them uh you know, really embrace this ethnic identities, a display of this ethnic identities and of course, the AC is a nationalist movement discouraged. um embrace of this ethnic identities and playing to that uh and so they were a little bit you know, uh awkward about uh involving or getting involved in that exercise. uh and did really have the credentials of traditional Zulu people pretty much. So, these were a band and universal figures of the and so Jay Z presented himself as the one person who would be a linkage between the AC and K and especially conservative folks who believe that the ANC was indeed a cause dominated party

and that fit the bill because you know, that embraced and uh quite large dressing up in Zulu traditional uh regalia uh is into singing and dancing Zulu songs uh Warriors Um and was very happy and comfortable participating especially in the annual Zulu Rituals Day and all all sorts of local uh uh rituals and that most people especially the leaders uh who are part of the UF would not attend at all uh but that participated in this and the main idea actually and this all happened with this and encouragement of the in fact, the national leadership. uh supported uh that was constantly contested by Jeff Hadden and Jeff. of course, did not quite have the Zulu traditional image. It's a sophisticated fellow lawyer Uh Zulu was not even that fluid and so it did not quite fit the bill of presenting a familiar traditional face of the NC to the locals and so and that succeeded in this um in 1994, the ANC. uh uh lost marginally uh and most people actually were saying that the election is not been rigged in case that it was quite possible that the NC would have won. They lost marginally as well in 1999 but one in 2004 and became the largest party and that growth within the province where the ANC have largely been seen as a dominated party was largely ascribed to the success of

Jay's strategy. and go back to the point I made before I move further. Beyond that point is that the strategy of of uh creating ethnic representation and diversity in the ANC had been pursued elsewhere Uh Just in. In in and not just in the free state where I was sent to. um but also in places like Limbo as I said as I as I mentioned earlier and and this is the interesting part especially in limbo Um so, the idea is that you have ethnic tensions um and you are aware that if one person is elected over the other, there's a possibility that uh man. Might might be withdraw. Uh from the party uh because they are against a particular leader from a particular ethnicity. um and so you and this was the kind of problem they faced especially in in so what they did there which was quite interesting was to bring in prior to this unification conference in Limbo. uh which is predominantly party speaking uh uh a province and most folks wanted uh as the inaugural chairperson uh but there are others uh not speaking or didn't quite like uh or did not prefer a mole and so you have the threat of a conference actually. um uh uh disintegrate. so they decided that they would bring in uh and the interesting thing about is obviously a native vendor speaker. uh and so because he

was vendor speaking, therefore, he was accepted as a local. It belongs. It was originally he was from vendor but Jewels uh identity ethnicity is not a dominant part of his identity. Uh in fact, you know, even though his vendors speaking, most people hardly even hear you speaking vendor. It's one of those all star nationalists. you know, who doesn't want uh a frown upon this ethnic identities. I would prefer kind of universal appeal and all that and also in the way he carries himself. That's it shows and so uh the pain is speaking even though they're all aware that was vendors speaking they almost all them enthusiastically voted for because in this case, the ethnic of his identity was not the dominant part. Uh two, they saw a national leader of the ANC, an intellectual, right? And so that that that even though initially, he's he's a candidate was predicated on the grace of him being a homeboy. Uh he was a homeboy that was embraced by everybody because he had this universal appeal. So you have a tooth from strategy here to some degree that your candidate has to be based on you being a local, you have to be a narrative so to speak. However, it helps if your identity goes beyond the ethnic identity and so the ANC then was able to use that in the case of Joel uh present him

as a local and yet a universal figure to unify the province um and that was partly the strategy in relation to is it? But what is that? they did especially when he started getting into legal problems beginning in 2005 when he was fired as a deputy president as a result of the charges related to the arms deal and later, there was a rape case and all that. What is that having established himself as a linkage? Pretty much between the ACK and National bringing locals who have been resistant to the ANC. uh behind the ANC. Um he then turned around and projected the the the the the accusations that have been leveled against him as some some kind of a persecution against him because he was Zulu speaking and he knew he was well aware of the sensitivity of of this ethnic and prejudice against one group or or another. So, he said they don't want me to be president because I am Zulu, right? And so, uh local Zulu speakers obviously rallied around it because they saw a persecution of their fellow uh uh uh local person on the on the basis of a shared identity. So it was an attack against Zulu and Yeah. He uses this point while even in the rape case where instead of justifying an English uses Zulu, um Zulu idiom and and so he taps into this also Zulu

pretty much against women to appear to the conservatives uh and so by the time that you go to the conference that is that in 2007 was you know, pretty much uh and as a group. um TOWARDS. to the surprise of many people, right? That some of these people when they've got to to pull up while they were even singing, Zulu traditional songs, songs at an NC conference which was pretty much unheard of and the idea was that they were going to vote for their own and of course, earlier, you had this fabricated Emails uh to spread or plant the idea that, you know, Uh uh to reinforce the idea that is that was not uh preferred for the presidency because he was Zulu and and and the ANC should remain closer So, so you know, the king's folk are mobilized to ensure that their own succeeds at the conference and to prove that Zulu have uh the same rights as causes so to speak in the context of that debate to be elected of the ANC and of course, that strategy succeeds. So, what you have there in Ghana was pretty much a return to that strategy Uh three things we saw at Kara which affirm that the ethnic mobilization point that I'm making Firstly, you had clips, you know, video circulating in social media of people calling on Zulu to come and present uh uh today's age um and what in

one in this particular clip, this young fellow was was even emphatic about uh uh Zuma even coming uh where is he? You know, he's so he must also be seen at and I'm sure there are many other other videos like that and the second one uh was You know, Zulu regimen and and that is sitting here talking to them and saying, I'm glad that you came and and I hope that those in authority would see your unhappiness and this your unhappiness might hopefully uh change their minds against incarcerating them, right? And thirdly, pretty much chances uh at You had NEC uh members who were there at to make sure you know to come in out, make sure that these things don't get out of hand and one of them was Lindy appears on TV on Sunday night. He gets asked by a journalist whether he had seen uh she says yes, I managed to speak in you know, to speak to to him for a minute or two but we didn't have time. He was rushing out to meet Ama at that moment, the most important constituency for Z or people to talk to was not the ANC. It was unable to at that moment was not a nationalist leader of the NC but he was a Zulu pretty much, you know, invoking and rally all these rules. Zulu ethnic resources behind it. um and so this is a strategy that the NC used uh Igbo as I chose in the next minute or two, they use effectively uh for good

reason in the early 90s but turned it around in the mid and in the early 2000 2000, he did exactly that at at uh but what is also happening is that he is he's at all. he's encouraged in this ethnic entrepreneurship by provision leaders because what you have in is a neo partial AC built Jay Jay is a set himself up as a godfather of Kaiser and politics. um and so these guys know that if Jay Z campaigns against you, if you don't have that in your corner, you might not win provisional position, provision, leadership. So, they are pussy footing around you and also joining in idea that uh it's unfair to arrest Jay Z. You must give him a pardon and so they in saying so they are reinforcing this this uh personality cards that is evolved around and reaffirming this neo personalized nature of ANC politics in Kn. So, you still have a lot of challenges in case uh especially in ensuring that you you you bring those folks more into the fold of National Universal Politics uh and that's the challenge that the ANC faces in a in and they can't just spectacle was just a manifestation of the persistence of that problem. Thank you. I let me stop there. It was a busy day. You've made your case You've made a case. We, it's not always politically correct to discuss the ethnicity uh but academics I have to deal with facts as they

are Things are busy. Uh I'll
move on to uh the next speaker
quickly. Uh no. Please don't
feel too constraint. Try to
limit yourself to your time. We
will extend the time as
necessary. uh to 8 o'clock. We
want to make sure that all our
pens and and and discusses to
uh do what they have to do in
terms of what they prepare to
do in this in this uh uh
discussion

How much time? Hello. Can you
hear me? Yes, I can hear you.
Tell me how much 1010 minutes.
Okay. Uh please stop me when I
go over. Um Look. Uh thank you
very much for inviting me to be
part of this um this
conversation was welcome. This
is the first time that I've
actually sat down to talk to
anybody about what has happened
in and beyond. I suppose just
uh you know, if you are social
media comments, mostly, you
know about what was happening
when it was happening I've had
to take a step back and really
watch how the conversation is
unfolded. and I'm very grateful
that WBC has gone before me
because he touches on a number
of issues that um are deeply
concerning for me and I'll
explain why but first, I want
to say that from uh the
colleagues who have spoken um
what we are discussing is um no
doubt the failures of the post
1994 project
I'm reminded of the Argentinian
poets. um and writer Eduardo

Galliano Who? Who? Who says
history never says goodbye?
History says, see you later.
because I think a number of uh
issues that we're dealing with
here is uh I mean indicates the
difficulties that we have had
to actually deal with very
complex. um legacies of South
African history and and in
South Africa, we talk a lot
about uh history and um it's
continued um presence um in our
era but I don't think that we
do as much as we think we are
doing in. In in. really
understanding different ways in
which um we can undo that
history. the first um of those
that I want to talk about. is
uh uh picking up on ABC has
said it's about the special
design of this country and the
way in which you continue to
use it in the present So, when
you look at um all the horrible
statistics that we were given
on education and and you look
at someone like me, for example
who grew up in a Montreal and
manufacturing Really? met
people. Africans who spoke
about the languages when I went
to university and you look at
um how we are doing on um on on
on on a university education
and the fact that so many young
people are being left behind.
we are reproducing uh these
kinds of identities and and
very limited ways of
understanding who we are in
this country. We're not giving
young people besides all the

other arguments that are important about why we need to have education but I think that if you to build a different kind of state. and the state that was articulated um in in the RTP. um the social desirable outcome that undo the the political and economic legacy of this country. You've got to look at education not just education for the sake of it even though that is important but it's a process and a tool that can help you in rebuilding and thinking differently about the kind of society that you want to have and exposure and and and giving young people especially opportunity to meet people that they would not normally meet um is is a very very good way of starting the problem that we see that we're talking about in the program that we really don't want to talk about that is very, very uncomfortable. The problem of ethnic uh entrepreneurship is if I can borrow from the particularly difficult to talk about because the post party state has not really applied itself on how it is going to undo those pockets of identity. that was shaped by apartheid system um and and and and and in ways that are very toxic for a democratic society what we see in Que is pretty much what we see in other provinces and um this is an embankment on the LLC in

particular because there. He continues to reproduce this through specific legislation that it pushes in this country as we speak. So, you have instead of undoing the of the legacy of the authorities at the Black administration at and and these divisions of Africans as these tribes that have um this primordial um identities and royalties, it reproduces that specifically in ways that actually overlap with apartheid design So, Look at in December last year. So, uh President Ramos signed into law. uh the the traditional leadership and uh the uh the traditional leadership and um at governance which basically is supposedly recognizes the role of traditional leaders and the role of um the and the even the thing is is is actually is extremely inaccurate um and and is pretty much part of colonial history but most importantly, you have. So, you have nine provinces and those provinces overlap with a tribal. um identities that was circumscribed by a party You haven't South Africa in those provinces, tribal authorities that supposedly recognize um the heritage and the cultural identities um of people who live there but actually go and overlap with the um with the borders with the tribal authorities uh that were designed by apartheid uh in the form of homelands. This is what

the NC has done in the last 27 years. So, this crisis of imagination and this unwillingness to actually really look at South African society and see how you take apart the Apartheid um special design and disable legacies in loyalties. that um that are that are defined by Kingsman affiliations. uh but not just that by um interesting mining and manipulation of of of of of of of of legacies of heritage and and traditional leadership from kings and all of that in order to have hands in your minds You look at what is happening in the platinum right now. You look at the the so called of success story of the royal king that very um distillation of what is is a is a is is is a colonial and apartheid legacy. It's the same as as as others and all of that and the struggles uh down in the in the in the Eastern Cape Wonderland. So, what is doing he traffics in what he knows he trades in what he knows but you in what he knows because he knows that the end is ambivalent in dealing with these issues. you saw uh uh a PCS talk about what happened in the early 90s but for me and I was working out for the ANC at that time. The most shocking image um that illustrated This was a weekend when Zuma and uh and uh Zulu Regalia in and and and we, you know, to talk to uh to people at a rally. It was so

um jarring uh in in in the way
in which it was crudely. um
using uh what is understood to
be type of of loyalty to tribal
identity but it was also an
admission I think of the ANC
ability. to handle the
challenges that came with the
opposition. the position that
had been formed for so many
decades that actually is what
we're attempting to break down
these um these notions of
ethnic mobilization as we saw
in homelands, it did appear it
appeared that the only way they
thought they could handle they
could they could campaign
against was to actually speak
his language and I think they
lay
the the the second um because
it's it's it's it's never just
about ethnic pride and and all
these things. It's about
resources and in case that and
I just before the the the court
judgment on Zuma, there was a
judgment. um that the cons had
handed down against Ima Trust
uh which was charging people in
work at uh for rent for to pay
rent in land. That is customary
theirs. enormous itself being a
construction of the the last
gift uh that gave us just a
week before elections and
created um this and and
ostensibly to bring IFK to the
elections. So, in the last 2025
years, we have been unable
really to think um in a focused
way on how do we undo the
special design. So, not only in

terms of ethnic um identities
but also in terms of you know,
the international stuff. So,
what you see in Phoenix partly
is also a result of that
The second issue that I um I
want to talk about quite
quickly is that I'm like, Adam,
I don't think that um it's
either I don't think that we
should read this as as as
poverty as food revolves all
you know, um uh or manipulated
political process by a
particular faction. I think it
can be II think it can be both
and I believe it is both but I
think it's also more than that.
this.

It's important to also
look at the timing here. I'm
not saying at any other time,
it wouldn't happen but this
happens in the middle of a
pandemic. that generally the
South African government has
not handled it well,
particularly in relation to
what COVID and the various
decisions that have been taken
um mean for poor people from
lockdown to a vaccine and all
of this. So, generally, these
people uh that that we see in
the streets are part of
communities throughout South
Africa that have been feeling
isolated, neglected, unheard in
the last um 18 months since um
the introduction of hard
lockdown. There's never really
been a conversation with the
majority of African people to
actually This is what COVID

means and these are the decisions that we're taking the state its particularly the army and and the police have policed uh the various lockdowns in relation to African communities in ways that that have been abusive that have been authoritarian and that have been completely um out of touch. how they should have. So, instead of talking to people and explaining why they have to give up certain liberties, we have seen the minister of police actually reveling in in in in in taking those liberties and and and actually being quite mean about it especially in African communities. If you look at the kind of arrest, if you look at the kind of uh even the brutality by elements in the military in those communities So, over and above inequality, exclusion, and all the historical issues that people are having. There's a a low intensity resentment but and it's very strong. There's a low intensity resentment against government and and and and has inherited that in many ways because of what had happened with hollowing out of institutions and and and and diverting resources and people finding themselves unemployed and all of that but I think that also he's handling of the COVID crisis and it's implications for South African communities has been

particularly alienating for people For example, I mean, I just want to make a very quick example. You know, people have talked about how has addressed the nation and all of that um but one thing that has been incredibly absurd in in in his style of communication in the in the in and the content of his message has been specifically to African communities. So, they are the government's approach to COVID, you know, unavoidable as it is. I'm I'm not arguing that um that you've had you had you have social distancing, social distancing that you have locked down. I'm not arguing with any of that but it's a approach has almost been like you are talking about South Africa as a society that is like a New Zealand that if you say people should social distance that it's it's it's it's easy to do that. It has been absence of empathy but also intelligent awareness of what these changes mean to people. A childhood friend of mine who lives um in in in sights in Cape Town when hard lockdown came. So I found her to try and see if she understood and and how how she was coping her most important question and comment at the time was that she kept on saying the streets are deserted for her who lives in in in such an overcrowded um community for her um who shares her house with eight other kids and it's

a it's a the emptiness in the street loomed large No one has ever really spoken about this. no one has ever really spoken about. Why would these communities not decongestant On top of that, you had massive presence of the military um in African communities These people, these people who even if they wanted to social distance to go to the bathroom, to go to the toilet, they had to get out of their house and and go to the toilet that they share with thirty other people. These people who live in these conditions you communicate with them in ways that show complete inability to understand what they could be struggling and instead of communicating with them, in fact, you intimidate them with the presence of the military

One of the one of the um striking things about about COVID in African communities was of course the adjustment of funerals and all that. No. Did the president of the country actually speak to people and say, we know you have to suspend your rituals. We appeal to you to to to to to handle this as you often handle emergency. So, there's an allegation of communities and especially poor people and community and African communities um to be specific. So whatever nations. Uh the so called insurrectionist and and and and and how it interns with

poverty, with unemployment and all these things. It happens at a time when people are actually tested to the brink and I agree with Tobi. I agree with Toby that um it's unfair to blame um to put this only on the door of the pool and to the extent that people have enforced to do. I'm not talking about those who drive in the city's and go and grab um TVs and all that but to the next time people actually have to look for food. I do think that the responsibility has to be laid squarely on the on on on on the governing party. Finally, I think that the biggest mistake that we can make at this time in South Africa is to be complacent about this. I think that I agree with Adam that violence in this country. Um is embedded in our DNA that our protests are violent but it's important to isolate the kind of violence that occurs and so when we talk about strategic, he of infrastructure in this, we need to be mindful of the fact that for the last 5 years, we have seen the the sabotage of railway. We have seen trains are being unable to move in many communities and the and the inability of government to actually come to terms with what is the cause of this and how to address it. So, I think over and above all these things that I have been raised by colleagues I think it's time for us to reckon with the kind

of society we have been building Post 1994 and to deal with history in ways that are imaginative at the moment and with all due respect to Tabby and others at the moment, the processes of government, the the the government itself comes across as Wasteland as a place where there's there's no there are no ideas and there's a place where there's no imagination. Thank you. It's so very profound in a new dimension. almost forgotten the pandemic and I think the points made have noted a call on our last speaker says, thank you. I I'm not going to repeat any of the issues that have been pointed out uh by the previous speaker

27. years after democracy, uh South Africa remains what it is accused of. but importantly, there is a perpetuation of the abuse of the maturity. by the majority party. and what we've seen is internal NC battles which are legion becoming clearly fictionalized The inability to deal with them within the party mechanisms the inability to deal with them in public spaces like the prosecution authorities and golfing the country in this mess. There's been a denial of reality by those elected and part of that problem was identified by the constitutional court in June last year when it said that the proportional representation

system needs to account of constituencies. I want Some of the issues raised but I just want to point out that certain scholars in particular from within the ANC have pointed out that 2% of NC members result in the people. of government at all levels. elected positions are then determined by the party and we've seen the mess that comes with lack of accountability. uh with uh Jacob Zuma escaping many many motions of no confidence So we remain deeply divided especially along ethnic lines. and critically along chronically violent lines. We have disturbed social relations We cannot talk of community. you know, people globally, not in this forum. Thankfully, like people globally talk of our communities, they don't exist in the form in which they did. when we were growing up. and even pre democracy where there was unification against the previous system. So, that sense of community has just been devastating. our inability to deal with the nightmares of our past that constantly impingement the present and which will be the nightmares of the future unless openly dealt with and this under the oldest liberation organization in the world structural violence is something that has now become embedded in the South African system. we talk of service delivery. You know, it's a

unique phrase that uh describes all manner of resentment as pointed out all manner of objection to uh dealing with issues at a local and other level but the dependency that that term has created is part of what we're dealing with with a dumb dumb education system. that's probably has adequately referred to and with the inability to deal with our past effectively Note just keynote that there have been scores of political assassinations in case who talk about these issues? various groups said, stop the looting Yet they themselves did very little to stop the looting that has progressively transpired and openly in the last two decades or so. So, when you have that clear example of looting from on high, what do we expect? Those who are disaffected terribly marginalized, and live on the periphery of fringes That is the condition. Sad though. It may be of the majority of people in this country indicating that many of us are alienated from political processes. and when I say us, I mean uh the population we see in what has been unfurling all the things that uh commentators have uh pointed to but it's also a terrible power of the powerless removed from all sorts of systems particularly under democracy Ironically, Igbo, We who many of us talking

and many of us commenting many of us in positions of influence and beneficiaries of democracy are now the system we fought against before. When people have nothing to lose themselves to social processes, they become extremely vulnerable and can be the Tinder to spark a violent eruption and it's easy to label as criminal from the comfort of our middle class but had unfinished business. The state just simply continued the old form and indeed the content hasn't much changed. Others have mentioned the retention of race-based classification, and various other throwbacks to the apartheid era which I will not repeat. Importantly, the elephant in the room of race and its sequel that in particular, the last two uh commentators have mentioned remain the elephant in the room and most commentators tend to pussy foot around it. The question we need to ask is, or was it pardon the compromising the com? of the liberation movement. Igbo as you describe them as the record is patently showing the apartheid state turned many in leadership in exile and inside the country into working for them. Zu has threatened but refused to reveal those names. When asked when I asked TLC commissioners including the latest Tom Matata about dealing with those who work for the other side. They said it could create problems

for whom who have we been protecting? Who masquerade as freedom fighters but who are paid apartheid agents state law and order leadership failure. and democracy eluding the majority when they can see that castle on the hill. belongs to and it's paid for by ill-gotten gains. What is that castle worth? When around it, there are shanks and yes, during apartheid like life, especially African was regarded as cheap. That's become endured in our culture. So, we need to deal with these four lines as well as the adequately represented ECONOMIC are the ills we have in our society. Violence is part of our socialization and culture. has been endemic but unlike Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Namibia, where they were liberation wars inside those countries, ours is now the war within one within the AC for power, privilege, and profiteering to various so-called population groups fighting to let go of the past and explore the possibility of a new nation be left of self-interested leadership and mediocre leadership. that continues to prevail from a flawed political economic system. The time now is to move beyond the politics of the past and reset this country to Make it what it ought to be and prevent the limitations of human possibility. Thank you. and Seth, thanks very much.

Eddie. Not last not least but
can you do a summer for us?
It's for us. in your smart way.
Please, Eddie.

Uh thank you. Thank you. I
think uh I've been following
this discussion. I'm in the the
point that we raised by um uh
from the beginning with Adam
and of course through the two
economic presentations and of
course you can say is also more
like you could say the the
projections, you know, using
statistical analysis Um this is
a so and now uh you can see. Uh
uh Cooper's You know, you spoke
uh like an elder as well um and
I think that the the the the
the the the debate that we have
it now because it's a
continuation of the debate that
is happening within South
Africa and it's really about
how do we characterize what has
just happened in South Africa
and also versus the issues of
perception. The the the the
elements of characterization
here. I put them into six which
came up in this debate. The
first one a political. You see,
you could say characterization
that is uh based on political
consideration. The Intra Party
the party, political dynamics,
questions of leadership,
Politiker
Kontinent
denn The NDC. the economic. So
here, this is where and our
economists have been talking
about the the that these
protests are a reflection of

the you could say the the social economic factors that have not been addressed uh since uh by the South African post issues of of inequality, poverty, unemployment, exclusion, and and so on and it's really an explosion of this uh uh that is due to to to to defects and and and Of course, you have the security element, the security agreement. This is what I spoke about as well and some people are not referred to it as well and and to say, once you use the security argument, then then you then have to use force to respond to this challenge. So, it's no longer a political party or socioeconomic poverty issues but this one is a security issue to threat to the security of the state and then you have to deploy the army but even the army when it there not to que down riots and so but then to to deal with a threat to the security of the state. So, so really this is the the the the the you could say the argument that and then they introduced the national Question and the National Question. I think both of them narrowed it down to to the question of ethnicity. The mobilization of ethnicity or pronunciation of ethnicity. um and I think They they they put quite a very interesting argument and then also spoke about what you can call. She said, is the crisis of post

1994 project but I thought perhaps is that uh if if we're to follow that argument, he what has just happened If you follow that line of thinking you should be perhaps the collapse of the post 1994 consensus not just project consensus in the sense that um there was uh an understanding that this is how this is uh um this transition were to unfold and there was a lot of narrative around it. Uh empowerment, black empowerment, and all these elements of it and perhaps this uh this consensus that has brought us up to hear it hits some some some some walls. So, if you follow this so so I would know I would I would say it's beyond the project but rather some sort of a concern that it kept this country the so called Rainbow Nation to get up to now and then finally I think he's the uh I thought analysis by very interesting that perhaps it was a reflection of the uh the the the COVID lockdown saturation point. You know, that the the COVID lockdown measures were so intense, so strong, and so heavy on the shoulders of people. They just need a such kind of a provocation to spill that into the streets. So I think uh if you were to ask me which of this line of thinking best describe what has just happened. I would say perhaps a combination of these and

perhaps it depends on how you look at them. I don't want to go into the insurrection revolutionary debate but I think all of them, these six arguments or line of thinking are quite useful in helping us to characterize what is just unfolded in South Africa but I'll come back to to some parts of it but then also for me from where I work, you know, when these things are happening, I was not in South Africa. I was doing my work on the African continent I was receiving all these messages about condolences and so on. So, for me, also the issue that I thought would be characterization but also the perception of what is happening. So, the characterization is an analytical is uh is the guys we have here on the panel, the analyst, and the politicians trying to correct it but for the ordinary people and for those who are not in South Africa, how they they they see or how do they perceive what unfolded in South Africa now I think I thought there were three lines of person The first one was to look to see this as a civil war happening in South Africa. uh and this was predominantly from the external dimension. You know what I mean, I had a friend of mine who was who was even visiting quite recently. He thought, you know, South Africans are

slaughtering each other with
pans in the streets and when he
started understanding what is
happening, he said, no but this
is what happened in my country
in March. people who are
looting stores and so because
this is what was happening even
if you look at the police
report, the fatalities arose
out of this were not due to
exchange of fire or violence um
but largely due to stamping
people trying to break into the
shopping malls as stepping over
each other and so so so the
perception of a civil war out
there and I think it's
something that I saw that the
GCI as was trying to address
deploying some of the ministers
from Al Jazeera and so on but I
think it's something that South
Africa did not do enough to try
to assist the external eyes to
and what was happening in
Salvador and there are people
out there who still think this
was a civil war or this is a
civil war that South Africa is
burning down. There was this
global Pana campaign for saving
South Africa and so on. So, I
think it's something that South
African leaders did not do
enough to try to correct this
perception because it's not
true. It's uh it's just of
course it happened quite a few
days but it was largely
something which is very common.
It has happened quite a number
of African cities and also in
parts of uh other countries

even in the United States, even in France by a century of people breaking out over some and breaking into stores and and and looting and so on. It's something that happened in some parts of Europe during the COVID lockdowns last year. So, the so the the the perception of this as a civil war and I think it's something that is sort of leaders who look at it. The second of course is the last word that is the last word. So it's linked to the social economic uh uh you could say a line of thinking to say this is a war of uh you know a class war linked to poverty and so on and so on but also there's been conversation. Lastly, you'll find part of it. Of course, in case of time, whether this was a racial war. So, there are those who see this as a racial war especially with what happened in parts of and that this was a war. I'm told that somebody was telling me actually that uh there was some even in some historically white area, some white white South Africans were even with petrol bombs ready to fight for their lives because they were fearing that they were all these black people who are going to jump over their properties and and you know and and and put into their lives. So, I think the issues of perception is something perhaps we didn't attend with adequately because issues of

perception, some perceptions could uh could not be uh of course they may not be the same as very thoroughly thought out analysis but perception can also influence action and in some cases can result in some of the things and I think there's also a broader issue that party which was talking about 1994 and so all of the of the relationship that you have vision. You have the plan, you have actions, and you have slogans and sometimes we we we we I mean we after Ninety-four, South Africa try to come to translate his vision uh into into plans. The RTP then later a number of other plans then now we have the national development plans but whether some of these plants are translated into action or degenerating into slogans and I think it's something that that he is but it's also an African debate how we use uh how visions are translated into plants but then these plants instead of becoming action, then they become slogans. They become part of the political narrative political discourse and we use them but there's no proper follow up mechanism. There are no physical resources to put into action. These plans. There's no national buy and so on and so on. So, so it's a big issue. something that of course even when we talk about agenda 2063, you look at the also at the USD Gs,

you look at some of issues. The plans. This is the actions that should arise out of those plans. This also the the the dangers of these plants becoming you know, slogans that are used by the political elites to rationalize or to justify certain actions and certain certain measures. So, Igbo, in conclusion for me sitting here and looking at this from from from from where I am, I The Africa's problems. They look like uh you know, in South Africa, this is what they call bubblegum Bubblegum music is very repetitive songs, you know, repetitive songs that to to distinguish one from another. You may have to find some drums, some lousy drum there and so on but it's when you're listening to it, it's like the same music. It's like the same song. it's being played, you know, SOUTH Africa's problems. If you look at the reports that the APR of Africa's problems, they look like they're all the same. It's just like variations. So, what has happened in South Africa is happening in other parts of the continent and it has happened even this year. There are quite a number of African countries that have experienced the same incidents of mass looting, people rising up and rebelling against COVID lockdowns and so on. So, perhaps it's the scale passes the dimension. perhaps it's the socioeconomic setting

as well. You could say even the national Question maybe in other cases, there's no Rochelle element to it but the south what is in South Africa has happened in other African countries. even during the course of of of this year and then, I think the issues are fair warning. Uh if you look at the ATM reports we did on South Africa and we do even in other Africans, other African countries, we do want that. If you don't attend to the socioeconomic challenges issues of inequality, poverty, this will 1 day escalate and become your political insecurity problems. So, this is what has happened in South Africa where the social economic issues they pile up. they build up and then 1 day. it means that trigger and then they become a political and socioeconomic challenge for the country and the pan African conversation about our challenges, I think is dominated by issues of integration in the African Union and so on the broad macro issues of development uh and then of course the peace and security issues even the peace and security element, the discussion uh uh uh regional conversation is all around the macro issues, the conflicts, the jihadist, the all of this thing. there is not conversation about this issue that characterized even much better than a lot of us about

this micro issues that happened within countries that can then lead to what we have just witnessed in South Africa and I think I want to leave it there to say that if you have a platform and then we have platforms across the continent that perhaps we need to talk more about this issue, this music, this bubblegum is a script that all you find in all African countries unemployment inequality, poverty, and all these problems, The sufferings that is described, you know, about people who living in informal settlements and so on that this is what is missing in our regional conversation. The conversation or pan African conversation about the problems facing our continent. Our problems are like music. We need both domestic and also there is no perspective and in how we deal and and and tackle these problems and I'll leave it there. Thank you. much. Well, thanks Eddie. Thanks for a good, a good job. Thanks very much, Eddie. I might leave me now just to to close the meeting by just saying the following. I think that the Adam set up the place for us with the three, the tripod inequality. security state capacity, I think we should add National Question health through the ends and the discussions sufficiently. I think uh uh analyze the failures, the cause of the

failures and the time bomb that uh Uh uh I just spoken about is not being peculiar to South Africa. Uh it's it's a national problem but I think it's peculiar to AFRICA in the sense that the level of inequalities uh deeper is this famous quotation from Mark's? It's not that someone is living in a shack. He's a fat **** Shaq. He's in the shadow of a palace and that describes South Africa. The the problem of sufficiently. the issue of security that uh uh Adam is really ventilated in great detail and linked SCT to state capacity not only in terms of the the city of the state to react to respond to test challenges has happened a few weeks ago but also in terms of delivery, the poorest nature of state bureaucracy. Those of us who are familiar with the South African bureaucracy, we've been in South Africa a number of times in the East to to try and inform this uh bureaucrats. lessons learned from Zimbabwe and the rest of Africa. There's clearly a uh a decline in the capacity of the state and the points that Adam made the need to take the state infused the state with new appointments, better skills, to the developmental state were very important. Then, the National Question with ABC. poignant In the examples she gave the the extent to which in

the in in in the deep state
appears to uh subs community
interests. around behind uh of
an overarching description of
the of the of the situation in
the country when these
communities need a particular
attention especially at the
time of the pandemic. It's
ready to thank you. I'm not
sure we are able to explore
sufficiently. the trajectory to
was a better economic and
political future. The debate
continues but I think we are
very honored and privileged to
have had all of you as partners
and discussions among the best
the good things that is all
recorded. It will be
transcribed. It will be
published and we will have your
contributions published in in
in different newspapers. So,
the debate continues. Uh thank
you very much indeed. Thank
you. Alright. Thank you. Thank
you. Thank you. Thank you. I
thank you very much. Thank you.
Thank you. Thank you. Thank
you. Thank you. Thank you.